

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

THOMAS W. BEATTY,  
Plaintiff,

v.

EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES  
LLC; EXPERIAN INFORMATION  
SOLUTIONS, INC.; AND TRANS  
UNION LLC

Defendant.

CASE NO. 2:19-cv-00852-MJH

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED by and between Plaintiff Thomas W. Beatty ("Plaintiff") and Defendants Experian Information Solutions, Inc. ("Experian"), Equifax Information Services, LLC, and Trans Union, LLC, through their respective attorneys of record, as follows:

WHEREAS, documents and information have been and may be sought, produced or exhibited by and among the parties to this action relating to trade secrets, confidential research, development, technology or other proprietary information belonging to the defendant[s], and/or personal income, credit and other confidential information of Plaintiff.

THEREFORE, an Order of this Court protecting such confidential information shall be and hereby is made by this Court on the following terms:

1. This Order shall govern the use, handling and disclosure of all documents, testimony or information produced or given in this action which are designated to be subject to this Order in accordance with the terms hereof.
2. Any party or non-party producing or filing documents or other materials in this action (the "Producing Party") may designate such materials and the information contained

therein subject to this Order by typing or stamping on the front of the document, or on the portion(s) of the document for which confidential treatment is designated, "Confidential."

3. If a Producing Party believes in good faith that, despite the provisions of this Protective Order, there is a substantial risk of identifiable harm to the Producing Party if particular documents it designates as "Confidential" are disclosed to all other parties or non-parties to this action, the Producing Party may designate those particular documents as "Confidential—Attorneys' Eyes Only."

4. To the extent any motions, briefs, pleadings, deposition transcripts, or other papers to be filed with the Court incorporate documents or information subject to this Order, the party filing such papers shall designate such materials, or portions thereof, as "Confidential," or "Confidential—Attorneys' Eyes Only" and shall file them with the clerk under seal; provided, however, that a copy of such filing having the confidential information deleted therefrom may be made part of the public record.

5. All documents, transcripts, or other materials subject to this Order, and all information derived therefrom (including, but not limited to, all testimony given in a deposition, declaration or otherwise, that refers, reflects or otherwise discusses any information designated "Confidential" or "Confidential—Attorneys' Eyes Only" hereunder), shall not be used, directly or indirectly, by any person, including the other Defendants, for any business, commercial or competitive purposes or for any purpose whatsoever other than solely for the preparation for and trial of this action in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. Except with the prior written consent of the individual or entity designating a document or portions of a document as "Confidential," or pursuant to prior Order after notice, any document, transcript or pleading given "Confidential" treatment under this Order, and any

information contained in or derived from any such materials (including but not limited to, all deposition testimony that refers to, reflects or otherwise discusses any information designated “Confidential” hereunder) may not be disclosed other than in accordance with this Order and may not be disclosed to any person other than: (a) the Court and its officers; (b) parties to this litigation; (c) counsel for the parties, whether retained outside counsel or in-house counsel and employees of counsel assigned to assist such counsel in the preparation of this litigation; (d) fact witnesses subject to a proffer to the Court or a stipulation of the parties that such witnesses need to know such information; (e) present or former employees of the Producing Party in connection with their depositions in this action (provided that no former employees shall be shown documents prepared after the date of his or her departure); and (f) experts specifically retained as consultants or expert witnesses in connection with this litigation.

7. Except with the prior written consent of the individual or entity designating a document or portions of a document as “Confidential—Attorneys’ Eyes Only,” or pursuant to prior Order after notice, any document, transcript or pleading given “Confidential—Attorneys’ Eyes Only” treatment under this Order, and any information contained in or derived from any such materials (including but not limited to, all deposition testimony that refers to, reflects or otherwise discusses any information designated “Confidential—Attorneys’ Eyes Only” hereunder) may not be disclosed other than in accordance with this Order and may not be disclosed to any person other than: (a) a party’s retained outside counsel of record in this action, as well as employees of said outside counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation and who have signed the “Declaration of Compliance” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A; (b) experts specifically retained as consultants or expert witnesses in connection with this litigation who have signed the “Declaration of Compliance” (Exhibit A);

(c) the Court and its personnel; (d) court reporters, their staffs, and professional vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the “Declaration of Compliance” (Exhibit A); (e) the author of the document or the original source of the information; (f) the party that produced the document(s) designated “Confidential – Attorneys’ Eyes Only,” including that party’s agents and representatives; and (g) Plaintiff.

8. Documents produced pursuant to this Order shall not be made available to any person designated in Subparagraph 6(f) or 7(b) unless he or she shall have first read this Order, agreed to be bound by its terms, and signed the attached “Declaration of Compliance” (Exhibit A).

9. All persons receiving any or all documents produced pursuant to this Order shall be advised of their confidential nature. All persons to whom confidential information and/or documents are disclosed are hereby enjoined from disclosing same to any person except as provided herein, and are further enjoined from using same except in the preparation for and trial of the above-captioned action between the named parties thereto. No person receiving or reviewing such confidential documents, information or transcript shall disseminate or disclose them to any person other than those described above in Paragraph 6 and Paragraph 7 and for the purposes specified, and in no event shall such person make any other use of such document or transcript.

10. Nothing in this Order shall prevent a party from using at trial any information or materials designated “Confidential” or “Confidential—Attorneys’ Eyes Only”.

11. This Order has been agreed to by the parties to facilitate discovery and the production of relevant evidence in this action. Neither the entry of this Order, nor the designation of any information, document, or the like as “Confidential,” or “Confidential—

Attorneys' Eyes Only," nor the failure to make such designation, shall constitute evidence with respect to any issue in this action.

12. Within sixty (60) days after the final termination of this litigation, all documents, transcripts, or other materials afforded confidential treatment pursuant to this Order, including any extracts, summaries or compilations taken therefrom, but excluding any materials which in the good faith judgment of counsel are work product materials, shall be returned to the Producing Party.

13. In the event that any party to this litigation disagrees at any point in these proceedings with any designation made under this Protective Order, the parties shall first try to resolve such dispute in good faith on an informal basis. If the dispute cannot be resolved, the party objecting to the designation may seek appropriate relief from this Court. During the pendency of any challenge to the designation of a document or information, the designated document or information shall continue to be treated as "Confidential" or "Confidential—Attorneys' Eyes Only" subject to the provisions of this Protective Order.

14. A Producing Party's disclosure of privileged or work-product protected documents, whether inadvertent or otherwise, shall not constitute a waiver of the privilege or protection from discovery in this case or any other federal or state proceeding. If a party receives documents that appear to be subject to an attorney-client privilege, the common interest privilege, or otherwise protected by a discovery privilege or immunity, that party must refrain from further examination of the materials that may be privileged and protected, and shall promptly notify the Producing Party, in writing, that he or she possesses material that appears to be privileged or protected. In the event a Producing Party discovers that it has disclosed privileged or work-protected documents, whether inadvertently or otherwise, the Producing Party



may provide notice to the recipient advising of the disclosure and requesting return of the privileged or otherwise immune documents (a “claw-back request”). Upon receiving a claw-back request, the receiving party shall make no further use of the privileged or otherwise immune documents and shall promptly segregate them in a manner that will prevent further disclosure or dissemination of their contents, and the receiving party shall undertake best efforts to promptly: (a) return or destroy all copies or versions of the documents identified by the Producing Party, including the original; and (b) expunge, from any other document, information, or material derived from the produced documents. This provision shall be interpreted to provide the maximum protection allowed by Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d). Nothing contained in this paragraph is intended to limit a party’s right to conduct a review of documents for relevance, responsiveness, or segregation of privileged and/or protected information before production.

15. Nothing herein shall affect or restrict the rights of any party with respect to its own documents or to the information obtained or developed independently of documents, transcripts and materials afforded confidential treatment pursuant to this Order.

16. The Court retains the right to allow disclosure of any subject covered by this stipulation or to modify this stipulation at any time in the interest of justice.

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Andrew J. Spangenberg

Andrew J. Spangenberg  
JONES DAY  
500 Grant Street, Suite 4500  
Pittsburgh, PA 15219  
Telephone: 412.394.9535  
Facsimile: 412.394.7959  
Email: aspangenberg@jonesday.com

*Attorney for Defendant  
Experian Information Solutions, Inc.*

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ John H. Goolsby

John H. Goolsby  
Goolsby Law Office, LLC  
475 Cleveland Avenue N, Suite 212  
Saint Paul, MN 55104  
(651) 646-0153

*Attorney for Plaintiff Thomas Beatty*

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Katherine E. Carlton Robinson

Katherine E. Carlton Robinson  
Schuckit & Associates, P.C.  
4545 Northwestern Drive  
Zionsville, IN 46077  
317-363-2400  
Fax: 317-363-2257  
krobinson@schuckitlaw.com

*Attorney for Defendant Trans Union, LLC*

Dated: November 6, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Vincent M. Roskovensky

Vincent M. Roskovensky  
Clark Hill PLC  
301 Grant Street  
One Oxford Centre, 14th Floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222-4895  
(412) 394-7716  
vroskovensky@clarkhill.com

*Attorney for Equifax Information Services,  
LLC*

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: November 7, 2019

  
UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE



**EXHIBIT A**

**DECLARATION OF COMPLIANCE**

I, \_\_\_\_\_, declare as follows:

1. My address is \_\_\_\_\_.

2. My present employer is \_\_\_\_\_.

3. My present occupation or job description is \_\_\_\_\_.

4. I have received a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order entered in this action on \_\_\_\_\_, 20\_\_\_\_.

5. I have carefully read and understand the provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

6. I will comply with all provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

7. I will hold in confidence, and will not disclose to anyone not qualified under the Stipulated Protective Order, any information, documents or other materials produced subject to this Stipulated Protective Order.

8. I will use such information, documents or other materials produced subject to this Stipulated Protective Order only for purposes of this present action.

9. Upon termination of this action, or upon request, I will return and deliver all information, documents or other materials produced subject to this Stipulated Protective Order, and all documents or things which I have prepared relating to the information, documents or other materials that are subject to the Stipulated Protective Order, to my counsel in this action, or to counsel for the party by whom I am employed or retained or from whom I received the documents.

10. I hereby submit to the jurisdiction of this Court for the purposes of enforcing the Stipulated Protective Order in this action.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 20\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_.

---

QUALIFIED PERSON